

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

Background:

In 2006 SHE went through a financial crisis for which SARO reviewed SHE's operations in December 2006. This had revealed that:

- Between 2003 and 2006 SHE's income from local resources has decreased by 65% and SHE's income from fundraising activities has decreased by 66%.
- Lack of consistency in SHE's income in the previous 4-5 years indicating no clear strategy
- Weak partnerships with multilaterals and bilateral
- Very high program delivery or overhead costs
- SHE is overstaffed
- Lack of focus on SRHR - though SRH programs account to about 7.78% of the total budget of SHE IPPF funds account to over 41% of the salary cost, 25% of the communication cost, 42% of the office supplies and consumables cost, 23% of the travel costs and 27% of the IEC material cost.
- The review also revealed disempowered management and adhoc decision making

A number of recommendations were made by the review team but there was little or no progress in the implementation of the recommendations. As no concrete steps were taken, review of performance in 2007 compelled IPPF SARO to change SHE's funding from core grant to project based funding. In 2008 SHE's core funding was restored in good faith that SHE will act on the recommendations and contribute to strengthening and stabilizing the organization. SARO continued to provide extra attention in terms of assistance to develop APB by inviting the CEO to Delhi and in many other instances.

However, in Dec , 09 SARO had to initiate yet another review mission to SHE Maldives based on decisions taken by the IPPF South Asia Regional Executive Committee in its meeting held on 1st 2nd Nov, 09 in Delhi due to the following:

- SHE Maldives was in a financial crisis once again as stated by the President, SHE in his email to the RD SAR. This appeared to be a repeat of 2006.
- Concern expressed by the President of SHE Maldives regarding the lack of information and knowledge in SHE Maldives regarding preparation of the Annual Programme & Budget (APB) and the fact that no single person in SHE Maldives can explain the procedure in this regard as stated by the President in his communication to the RD. The REC noted that the APB for 2010 had not been submitted to SARO by SHE. In this connection the RD, however, pointed out to the REC that SARO had trained staff of SHE Maldives on a number of occasions and the Acting CEO Fazna Shakir had attended the Vision Building Workshop in 2008 and all other capacity building workshops in 2008 and 2009 and was very well aware of the process. In between training on the eIMS and APB had also been provided to SHE Maldives from FPA Sri Lanka. SARO had offered to provide SHE Maldives support by inputting the APB into the

Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009

eIMS provided SHE Maldives sends the activity and budget in 'Excel' or any other format to SARO. But this has also not been done by SHE Maldives.

- The Audited accounts and Management Letter for 2008 have not been received from SHE Maldives by SARO. As a result of which the third instalment of IPPF core grant cannot be released.
- That the EXCO of SHE Maldives had not informed the Regional Director (RD) of SAR regarding the hiring of the then CEO of SHE Maldives Mr. Zuhair at the time of his appointment in 2009 and subsequently while terminating his services. The REC was of the view that the EXCO / NEC of any Member Association while it is autonomous in its functioning should, however, follow due process and procedure in informing the RD regarding the hiring of a new CEO and / or the termination of his services.

The review mission comprised Mrs. Padma Cumaratunge, Chairperson, IPPF South Asia Regional Executive Committee and Mr. Pradeep Patro, Director, Advocacy and Resource Mobilization, IPPF SARO.

The review team could not prepare a ToR or an agenda in advance of the visit as SHE did not respond to the emails of the Regional Director requesting information on the current crisis being faced by SHE and the assistance they require. However the team proceeded with the mission as it was important for the region to proactively reach out and assist member associations facing problems.

Discussions with EXCO members on the 12th Dec 09: The team met several members of the SHE EXCO on 12th to understand the problems faced by SHE. In this meeting, the SHE EXCO unanimously expressed that they are fully committed to SRHR and are proud to be members of IPPF. They accepted that in the last few years SHE has not been able to fulfill its commitment to SRHR and the IPPF Strategic Framework. They also recognized that SHE has not made use of technical and financial assistance provided by IPPF in the last few years. They expressed that these were one of the main reasons for the departure of the earlier CEO.

At the same time they expressed their desire to take the necessary steps to ensure that SHE remains totally committed to SRHR and the IPPF Strategic Framework. They expressed that now SHE is in a crisis and look forward to assistance from IPPF for SHE to overcome the present crisis and move from strength to strength.

Thereafter the team interviewed staff members individually to understand the causes of the current crisis faced by SHE. The team also met other EXCO members who were not present in the meeting of the 12th, later during the visit.

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

The team met the following staff members:

Fathmath Naila	Dr.Mausooma Kamaldee	Maria Saeed
Nashida Sobry	Zileena Zahir	Fazna Shakir
Mariyam Zila	Iyasha Leena	Soumya
Aminath Maeesha		

Meeting with the statutory auditors:

The team met the statutory auditors of SHE to seek clarifications on what is delaying the audit of 2008. The auditors shared that the data of 2008 has not been entered into the computer completely and data entered is not accurate. The auditors have reconciled the accounts with bank statements and have found a lot of discrepancy. They have pointed the same to SHE and await SHE to do the corrections. They will be able to comment further only after commencement of audit process.

There is an overall feeling among the auditors and SHE that all financial data of 2008 may not be available.

This is a cause of concern. It is also a cause of concern for 2009. Therefore SHE should initiate audit of 2009 records immediately after the audit of 2008 is completed.

The observations made by the team are as follows:

Environment – External

SHE has traditionally been supported significantly through local donations and the government apart from IPPF. However such income has drastically fallen since there has been a change in the government recently. Changes in government can influence resources raised by an organization, however if the support for the cause and the organization is strong, such influence is normally limited. However the effect on SHE's resources clearly indicates that support to SHE from the local businesses and government was more political in nature than REAL support for the cause. This was also reconfirmed in individual interviews.

Globally the aid environment has changed and IPPF has been emphasizing it over the last few years. In addition IPPF has supported the development of Resource Mobilization Strategies and provided ongoing support. However SHE has not been able to take it forward towards implementation. With the lifting of the Global Gag Rule, UNFPA's funding has increased significantly which is a potential opportunity for IPPF MAs. However SHE has not put any efforts to capitalise on this opportunity.

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

Overall there has been a total neglect of Resource Mobilization in spite of the awareness about the changing environment globally and the implications for the changing political situation locally.

Such a focus is more essential since there is an increase in conservative forces in Maldives which will require greater advocacy and resources for SHE to achieve its mission and vision.

SHE will need to invest in building capacity in Resource Mobilization and strengthening support for SRHR among public, businesses and influences in Maldives for long term sustainability instead of depending on political affiliations for resource mobilization.

Environment – Internal

The review team has categorised its observations in the internal environment of SHE in three areas. They are a) Governance b) Commitment to SRHR c) Human Resources

Governance:

It was found that EXCO met almost every other week (except when they did not have a quorum) to discuss various issues of SHE. During interviews it was also clear that EXCO took most decisions concerning the operations of the organization in such meetings rendering the CEO / Acting CEO / Senior Management disempowered. It was also confirmed that some decisions taken by Senior Management regarding the operations were ridiculed by the EXCO thereby further disempowering senior management. Many such instances were observed like salary increases are announced by EXCO etc. It is also normal practice for EXCO members to call and speak to staff members on the operations of the organization and thereafter question the management based on the feedback received from staff. There is very low morale and no ownership or sense of responsibility for the operations of the organization or the current crisis. This was reconfirmed from the fact that in spite of the current crisis where the staff have not been paid their salaries of November yet and the audit needs to be completed for SHE to get funds from IPPF – though a new accounts person has been hired since over a week, the person has not yet been briefed that she needs to work on the Audit of 2008. Both the Acting CEO and the EXCO thought it was the other's responsibility to brief the accounts person.

This aspect was confirmed both by the EXCO and the staff. During the de-briefing, EXCO confirmed that they have been undertaking the management function of the organization whenever they didn't have a CEO which included the period of over a year when Fazna was the Acting CEO. They also confirmed that the Acting CEO did not have the powers to take decisions. It was informed that this was not good practice at all and that an Acting CEO is expected to perform the complete functions of a CEO with all the powers. At the same time it was found that

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

the frequency of meetings remained the same whether a CEO was in office or not and the issues discussed too were not very different.

Overall it was found that the EXCO has been managing the operations of the organization. The senior management is totally disempowered and disillusioned and SHE has been managed more like a 'mom and pop store'.

At the same time it was also observed that governance/EXCO has not been performing its role as demonstrated by the following instances:

- The CEO's performance has never ever been evaluated or the CEO appraised. There were no records at all and the staff and volunteers confirmed this.
- There has been no basis (recorded) for the selection of a CEO or an Acting CEO at any time.
- Governance has played no role in proactively devising policies or strategies in advance to mitigate the expected change in funding with changes in the political environment in Maldives.

This was found to be surprising as in the South Asia Region; the role of governance has been emphasized especially in the last 3 years and recently at the RC in July a workshop on 'strengthening governance-management interface' was organized. ippf has also come out with the Code of Good Governance which aims to strengthen volunteering and governance in ippf.

Lack of commitment to SRHR:

SHE's lack of commitment to SRHR has been a concern to IPPF SARO and has been pointed out repeatedly over the last 5 years. The CEO, Mr. Zuhair was also open about the fact that SHE is not committed to SRHR. This was also one of the reasons for the reduction of SHE's core grant in 2008. However it was noted that this has not changed at all. The scope of SHE's SRHR programs continues to be very limited. In the interviews all staff confirmed that there was an unwritten and implicit policy or approach not to focus on SRHR. Repeated requests by staff members of the Thalassemia and other programs to integrate SHRH into their activities for cost effectiveness and to provide comprehensive services to clients were denied. This is largely attributed to the former CEO by staff. However since this did not change when Zuhair was not around for over a year and the fact that the EXCO was meeting so frequently and taking management decisions, it is difficult to buy the argument.

Lack of commitment to SRHR is further demonstrated by the following:

- Leaflets on Unsafe Abortion were not printed citing funding problems though there have been no funding problems from IPPF.
- The Youth kiosk in the SHE building was closed to provide space on rent.

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

- In spite of constant financial support through core and restricted funds the FP department still uses very old computers unlike other departments

Human Resources / Staff:

Interviews with staff members revealed that staff did not have any space or freedom to express their views at all in any issue what so ever. Management (CEO) was not open to views at all. Whenever some staff members expressed their views the reply was 'I am the boss, you have to do what I say'. Such staff members also had to face difficulty later for expressing their views. This was unanimously expressed by all staff members who were interviewed.

Staff meetings are never held. Only HOD meetings are held where HODs are told what to do with minimal or no discussions.

It was also expressed and confirmed by many staff members that certain departments had preferential treatment.

Though SHE is a small organization, it has been split into too many departments/sections and there is absolutely no communication or cooperation between the different departments.

All of the above has contributed to an environment where staff is totally de-motivated and unhappy. The following policies/rules currently in effect have made the environment worse:

1. Any staff member who reports to office even a minute late after the scheduled start time of 8 AM is marked absent
2. Staff is not allowed to leave the office premises during lunch break to buy food of their choice. They have to place order
3. Staff members do not have their email ids for official communication. A common email id is shared by all for official communication and such emailing can be done from one computer only.

Salaries have not been paid on time since June 2009 and the salaries of November were not paid until mid December. Salaries have been reduced by 10% and the Ramzan allowance too has not been given.

It was shocking to hear that the staff members in the Thalassemia Lab did not have the required protective gear like masks and were undertaking lab processes by exposing themselves to risk.

Some statements made by staff members describing the current environment are given below:

- Mismanagement since last 2-3 years
- Environment political especially since 2009
- We are frustrated

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

- SHE is dying

Overall the current situation in terms of HR is very grim. SHE hasn't had a leader for a very long time. Though earlier the situation was not as bad in terms of finances, but it was the same in terms of HR. Therefore this could be a reason why SHE has not been able to attract good talent in the past.

Systems and processes

Having found the above, the team felt it is important to review the systems and processes in the organization and it was shocking to find that almost no systems and processes were there in SHE as given below:

- There is no approved (by EXCO) organization structure
- Recruitments are done without advertisements or needs assessment
- Most staff members did not have job descriptions except a few working in the lab. These too were found to be lacking.
- No orientation of new staff
- No confirmation after probation
- No one knows what they are supposed to do and their authority
- Work assigned on a daily basis and ranges from logistics to anything for any staff member
- No basis for transfer of people from one department to another, even skills required for the positions are not considered (Earlier nurse is currently Director Operations, Earlier procurement officer was transferred to accounts etc)
- No appraisals of any staff member ever
- No minutes of any staff meeting or HOD meeting. No record of meeting dates too
- Clients' needs not respected, clients have been asking for pregnancy tests as a service for a long time.
- DNA reagents not procured since April 09
- No AMC of equipment
- Most staff claim that they do not have work to do – some for last two years
- No handover or transfer of responsibility when staff leave or take new roles
- No procedures or manuals for any department

Organization structure

Thereafter the team review the organization structure and found that:

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

1. SHE is heavily overstaffed (Examples: Four people in counselling section servicing only about 1 client per day, Two persons in IEC section with hardly any meaningful work, Too many people in admin who do not know what to do)
2. SHE has too many departments and sections without any integration
3. Program Officers are not technically qualified or do not have the required experience
4. Too many support staff

Overall the structure is very hierarchical and bureaucratic which promotes inefficiency and redundancy.

Unanswered questions:

Few unanswered questions remained which the team decided not to pursue. They are as follows:

- Is it true that SHE could not recruit a CEO for 1.5 years (2007-2008)?
- What was the alternate plan of action adopted by EXCO?
- If a CEO could not be recruited in 1.5 years, on what basis was an assumption made that a CEO will be recruited within a month in 2009 at 2007 salary levels (15000 Rufiah per month)?
- If CEO salary was fixed at 15000 why was Zuhair taken at 25000 (in 2009) in spite of the problems in his past tenure?
- Why has SHE suddenly reduced the CEO salary to 15000 after Zuhair was asked to leave?

Recommendations

The review team makes the following recommendations:

- EXCO should recruit a strong candidate for position of CEO with a clear Job Description (as approved by the REC) and a reasonable tenure by End of January 2010
- EXCO should develop monitoring framework for EXCO to monitor SHE and appraise the CEO in line with the CEO appraisal format approved by the REC by the end of January 2010
- Since the CEO has already joined we recommend that he is oriented to IPPF and SRH by a visit to SARO at Delhi at the earliest. In addition, he should also get hands on orientation by a SAR MA CEO. In this instance we recommend FPASL due to its proximity to Maldives.
- Governance should start fulfilling its role and give space for CEO to manage operations. IPPF's code of good governance should be referred to as it defines the role of volunteers clearly. A capacity building workshop on the code of good governance was done for RC members in 2009. The same learning should be transferred to all members of EXCO. It is recommended that EXCO meets on a quarterly basis.

The new CEO should:

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

- Restructure the organization and report to SARO for SARO to report to REC by middle of Feb 10:
 - Develop an appropriate structure for SHE as per the committed funds available for various programs and have it approved by EXCO
 - Develop job descriptions for each position
 - Develop appraisal criteria for each position
 - Fill in positions through a thorough recruitment process
- Terminate redundant staff after the restructuring process
- Thalassemia Lab, SRHR programs and Counselling should be treated as separate cost centers and viability assessed based on funding available for each cost center.
- A business plan should be developed based on the above by Feb 2010
- The office space should be restructured physically to allow staff to collaborate and feel they are working for one organization. Such integration will also make the services client friendly and promote efficient use of human resources. For example all services provided by SHE should be in one floor manned by a common reception and waiting area etc. This should be done by March 10
- Create a completely transparent and consultative environment to regain trust of staff. A culture of empowerment with decentralized decision making should be created.
- Develop/adapt the following by April 10:
 - Adopt IPPF HR principles
 - Develop HR manual
 - Develop accounts manual
 - Develop finance and administrative procedures
- The following capacity building is immediately required:
 - Capacity building of Staff and Volunteers in Resource Mobilization and Advocacy
 - Capacity building of Staff on thematic program areas (5 As)
 - Capacity building of volunteers to monitor SHE, CEO
- Develop strategic plan 2010-15 by April 10
- Develop a detailed Resource Mobilization plan by March 10
- Conduct 2009 financial audit by End of Feb 2010

SHE should send a progress report to update SARO on the implementation of the recommendations by 15th Feb 2010 to enable progress to be reported to REC.

Immediate next steps

While the above recommendations will implemented over the next six months to a year, the review team recommends that the following steps be undertaken by end of January 2010:

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

- EXCO should recruit a strong candidate for position of CEO with a clear Job Description (as approved by the REC) and a reasonable tenure by End of January 2010
- Complete the audit of 2008 and submit it to IPPF SARO by end of Jan 10. It was gathered during the meeting with EXCO and the statutory auditors that the audit will be completed in 2 weeks i.e by end of December 2009 so that the next installment of IPPF core grant of \$25903 can be released
- SHE needs to find out its total current liabilities as on 31st Dec 2009.
- Increase working hours of SHE
- Provide email access to staff immediately
- Express commitment to SRHR with the introduction of pregnancy tests in the SRHR program immediately
- SHE should restructure its building loan by extending the loan period and reduce the installment to release some funds for meeting salary obligations of Thalassemia lab and counseling services.
- Input of half yearly report of 2009 and APB for 2010 release of 4th and 5th installment

In 2009 no IPPF APB activities have been implemented except for the FP clinic. The following is estimated funds utilized in 2009 of a total IPF of \$129513:

The total unrestricted grant of **US \$ 129,513** is allocated to SHE Maldives for the year 2009 and the same is payable in 5 installments of US \$ 25,903 each. We have remitted only 2 installments of US \$ 25,903 (**Total US \$ 51,806**) till date as they have not submitted their audited financial statements and Management Letter for the year 2008 which is the requirement for release of 3rd installment. They have also not input their half yearly report and Annual Programme Budget into EIMS which are the further requirements to release the 4th and 5th installments of core grant.

SHE needs to seek permission of the RD IPPF SARO to carry forward the under spend of \$ 64878 to next 2010

APB 2010

The review team met the staff of SHE and discussed to finalize activities for APB 2010. It was wonderful to see the ideas and participation of staff members of SHE in the following activities were decided. SHE needs to develop a budget and send the same to IPPF SARO. The Team offered that IPPF SARO will input the APB into eIMS for SHE as they currently do not have the capacity. The details are in annexure I. SHE should develop a budget for these activities and inform SARO for SARO to enter into eIMS for SHE.

DEBRIEFING TO THE EXCO

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

The observations made by the review team were shared with the SHE EXCO on 15th December 09. Overall the EXCO welcomed the recommendations and expressed their commitment to take them forward. The power point presentation which contained most of the information of this report was left behind so that the recommendations can be taken forward while the final report is awaited.

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

Annexure I

Advocacy:

To advocate for a strong SRHR component in the draft youth policy of Maldives

Activities:

1. Gather compelling evidence on issues faced by young people (conduct research)
2. Create awareness among policy makers on issues faced by young people and sensitize them on the need to address these issues.
3. Launch a campaign among young people
4. Initiate a process of dialogue with religious leaders on the importance of SRHR especially for young people through a round table of religious leaders from many countries

Adolescents:

To provide information on comprehensive SRHR to 50,000 young people by 2012

Activities:

1. Develop comprehensive information on SRHR adapted to the need of young people of Maldives
2. Develop mechanism using wireless/telecom technologies to provide information and engage young people in discussions on their reproductive health
3. Provide information to young people
4. Develop partnership with Scouts and guides to mainstream course on SRHR in their curriculum (learn from the FPASL experience)
5. Develop partnership with other NGOs working with youth to include SRHR information in their programs (especially in islands where SHE's reach is limited)

Access:

To strengthen SHE's capacity and services on FP

Activities:

1. Change the FP clinic to a Sexual and Reproductive Health Clinic by including more services like STI Management, Sexual Problems faced by men and women, Men's SRH
2. Review the registration form for clients to ensure no discrimination and to increase access (currently registration form asks questions like number of time married etc)
3. Provide enough visibility to the SRH clinic and services provided in SHE building
4. Provide pregnancy testing as a service in the SHE SRH clinic

**Report of the review mission to SHE Maldives
Mrs. Padma Cumaratunga and Mr. Pradeep Patro
11th to 16th December 2009**

5. Increase working hours of the SRH clinic
6. Build technical capacity of SHE SRH service providers

Abortion:

To develop strong referral linkages with IGMH for PAC

1. Develop IEC material on public health impact of unsafe abortion and prevention of unwanted pregnancies
2. Develop referral partnership with IGMH
3. Provide technical expertise and training to IGMH to move from D&C to MVA

AIDS:

SHE to develop some activities in AIDS. They should plan activities which will have synergy with their Global Fund project.